International Journal of Elementary Education
Volume 6, Number 2, Tahun 2022, pp. 276-281
P-ISSN: 2579-7158 E-ISSN: 2549-6050
Open Access: https://doi.org/10.23887/ijee.v6i2.46763

Project Citizen Model in Citizenship Education and Its Impact on Critical Thinking Skills for Elementary School Teacher Education Students

Mella Indra Handayani[1*], Haryanto[2], Ari Wibowo[3]

[1,2] Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
[3] Universitas PGRI Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received February 22, 2022
Accepted May 06, 2022
Available online May 25, 2022

Kata Kunci:
Berpikir Kritis, PKn & Project Citizen

Keywords:
Critical Thinking, Civics & Project Citizen

This is an open access article under the CC BY-SA license.

Copyright © 2022 by Author. Published by Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha.

ABSTRAK

Pendidikan kewarganegaraan salah satu mata pelajaran yang berperan penting dalam menciptakan dan mewujudkan smart and good citizenship. Peserta didik diharapkan memiliki keterampilan secara intelektual dalam kehidupan berbangsa dan bernegara, kemudian pengetahuan dan keterampilannya itu akan membentuk suatu karakter pada siswa yang dijadikan sebagai kebiasaan hidupnya sehari-hari dan mencerminkan warga negara yang baik. Salah satu instructional treatment dalam pembelajaran PKn untuk mencapai tujuan-tujuan di atas adalah Project citizen. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis pengaruh critical thingking mahasiswa melalui penerapan model pembelajaran project citizen pada mahasiswa semester II program studi S1 Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar. Penelitian ini adalah penelitian kuantitatif dengan metode quasi experiment. Penelitian dilaksanakan dengan subjek penelitian sebanyak 50 mahasiswa. Adapun teknik pengumpulan data menggunakan tes. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa penerapan model pembelajaran project citizen dengan tahapan mengidentifikasi masalah, memilih masalah sebagai bahan kajian kelas, mengumpulkan informasi, mengembangkan portofolio kelas, menyajikan portofolio, dan merefleksikan pengalaman belajar, dapat meningkatkan critical thinking mahasiswa. Hal tersebut dibuktikan dengan pengujian kelas eksperimen yang diajarkan dengan penggunaan model pembelajaran Project citizen memiliki nilai rerata yang lebih tinggi dibandingkan dengan kelas kontrol yang diajarkan dengan model konvensional.

ABSTRACT

Civic education is one of the subjects that play an important role in creating and realizing smart and good citizenship. Students are expected to have intellectual skills in the life of the nation and state, then their knowledge and skills will form a character in students which is used as a habit of daily life and reflects good citizens. One of the instructional treatments in Civics learning to achieve the above objectives is Project citizen. This study aims to analyze the effect of student critical thinking by applying the project citizen learning model to second-semester students of the Elementary School Teacher Education S1 study program. This research is quantitative research with a quasi-experimental method. The research was carried out with 50 students as research subjects. The data collection technique used a test. The results showed that applying the project citizen learning model with the stages of identifying problems, choosing problems as class study material, gathering information, developing class portfolios, presenting portfolios, and reflecting on learning experiences, can improve students' critical thinking. The test of the experimental class evidences this taught using the Project citizen learning model, which has a higher average value than the control class taught using the conventional model.

1. INTRODUCTION

Education, in general, is an attempt to civilize or glorify humans (Al-Khansa & Dewi, 2021; Pane & Dasopang, 2017). For the implementation of education properly and appropriately, we need a science that examines in-depth how education should be implemented (Sujana, 2019). Education is a communication process that contains a process of transformation of knowledge, values, and skills, both inside and outside school, in the community, in the family environment, and the learning takes place throughout life (long life learning) from one generation to generation (Setyowati, 2019; Thadi, 2019; Yuliah, 2020). Three skill units are most in-demand and important in life in the 21st century, one of which is learning and innovation skills with four aspects, including critical thinking (Astuti & Sahono, 2019). Critical thinking has been a central educational goal since 1942 (Ulfa et al., 2018; Yanizon & Adiningtyas, 2018). Critical thinking is a systematic cognitive process that is applied in assessing something to make good judgments and decisions that involve one's mental activity in collecting, categorizing, analyzing, and evaluating information or evidence to

*Corresponding author.
E-mail addresses: indra997@gmail.com (Mella Indra Handayani)

conclude to solve problems (Aini et al., 2019; Indayani et al., 2021; Sulaiman et al., 2019). Critical thinking skills are needed so that mastery of a concept by students not only in the form of memorizing several concepts they have learned but also apply the concepts they have in other aspects (Ritonga et al., 2020). The importance of critical thinking skills in the world of education no longer needs to be debated. Alignment of critical thinking can be trained and developed with various subjects that support the development of critical thinking because no subject specifically focuses on training students' critical thinking skills (Astuti & Sahono, 2019; Darwati & Purana, 2021; Ramdani et al., 2020). Therefore, it is important to apply it in various subjects of critical thinking skills, one of which is Citizenship Education (PKn) which in the 2013 curriculum needs to be presented and processed in an interdisciplinary manner.

However, the reality on the ground shows that Civics learning can still not maximize students' critical thinking skills. The learning provided by the lecturer does not involve students actively. In addition, students tend to be passive when the learning and discussion process takes place. Students tend only to listen and take notes on the material presented by the lecturer. Students' lack of active involvement in this learning causes a lack of student skills in critical thinking, for example, asking questions, expressing opinions, and solving problems. Students' lack of critical thinking skills in the Civics learning process, especially on State of law material, causes students to only memorize existing concepts and theories without wanting to explore further to be understood in depth. The difference in the level of critical thinking of each student is caused by many factors and can affect their learning outcomes. Therefore, a learning model with the right strategy is needed to improve critical thinking skills. One of them is the project citizen learning model.

The project citizen model is an innovative learning model that can improve students' critical thinking (Fajri et al., 2021; Iriansyah, 2020). The project citizen model is carried out through a learning approach process that helps students to find problems from real events and collect information through self-determined strategies to make problem-solving decisions which are then presented in the form of performance (Astuti & Sahono, 2019; Hakim & Pradityayudha, 2021; Widodo et al., 2018). The project citizen learning model is designed in a learning design that synergistically combines problem-solving models, social research, social involvement, group learning, simulations, deep dialogue and critical and creative thinking, value clarification, and democratic learning (Luqman, 2017; Mulyoto & Samsuri, 2017; Nusarastriya et al., 2017). This model can assist teachers in involving students in actively participating and developing critical thinking. It is because this model focuses on the involvement of students as a whole in terms of attitudes, knowledge and skills (Mariyani, 2018; Sahari & Wahyudi, 2020).

Previous studies have revealed that project citizens can develop their ability to work cooperatively, innovatively, creatively, and critically through empirical practice learning activities (Fajri et al., 2021). The results of subsequent studies also reveal the same thing. It is stated that through project citizenship, students' critical thinking skills can be significantly improved through learning outcomes issued after learning (Saylendra, 2017). Other research also reveals that the basic values of anti-corruption education will be understood directly by students when through the learning process with the project citizen model while the values that students will achieve consist of the values of honesty, caring, independence, discipline, responsibility, hardwork, modesty, courage and justice (Azmi, 2020). Based on the results of previous studies, it can be said that the application of the project citizen model significantly improves learning outcomes and social skills. However, in previous research, there has been no study on the application of the project citizen model in civic education and its impact on the critical thinking skills of elementary school teacher education students, so this research is focused on this study to know the significant differences in critical thinking skills between experimental class students taught by the project citizen learning model and control class students taught by lecture learning.

2. METHOD

This type of research is quasi-experimental with a non-equivalent control group research design. Quasi-experimental design is a design that has a control group but as a whole does not function to control external variables that meet the implementation of the experiment (Indayani et al., 2021). In this case, the experimental class was given learning treatment using the project citizen model, and the control class was not given the project citizen model. The population in this study were second-semester PGSD students at PGRI Yogyakarta University. The sample used consisted of two classes, class A7-21 as the experimental class and class A8-21 as the control class. The number of students in both classes, both experimental and control classes, was 25 students each. Data collection in the study was carried out using the method of tests, interviews, and observations with research instruments in the form of critical thinking skills tests in the form of description questions. The data obtained in the study were then analyzed by data analysis

techniques using the normality test, homogeneity test and independent samples test with the help of the SPSS application.

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

Research on applying the project citizen model in civic education learning is carried out through univariate and inferential analysis. Univariate analysis was conducted to determine the experimental and control classes' average pretest and post-test scores. The results of the univariate analysis are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Average and SD Student Scores

Group	Mean and Standard Deviation		
	PRE	POST	c
Experiment	48.88(11.36)	77.12(13.47)	28.24(12.45)
Control	53.12(13.25)	73.92(12.01)	20.80(12.86)

Based on table 1, the average pretest value of the experimental class is 48.88, the average post-test value is 77.12 and an increase in the value of 28.24 is obtained. Meanwhile, the control class's average pretest value was 53.12 and the post-test value was 73.92 with an average increase of 20.80. Thus, it can be concluded that the test of the experimental class taught using the Project citizen learning model has a higher mean value than the control class taught using the conventional learning model. After obtaining the results of univariate analysis, the research then proceeds to inferential analysis. Inferential analysis was carried out with normality, homogeneity, paired sample t-test, and independent-sample t-test. The normality test was conducted to determine whether the research data were normally distributed. Normal data is required before parametric statistical analysis (paired-sample t-test and independent-sample t-test). In parametric statistics, two normality tests are often used, the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test and the Shapiro-Kwilk test. The results of the pretest and post-test normality tests for the experimental and control classes can be seen in Table 2.

Table 2. Normality Test Results

Class		Kolmogorov-Smirnov[a]		Shapiro-KWilk		Distribution conclusion
		Statistic	Sig.	Statistic	Sig.	
PRE	Experimen	0.135	0.200	0.959	0.395	Normal
	Control	0.146	0.176	0.942	0.167	Normal
POST	Experimen	0.107	0.200	0.962	0.446	Normal
	Control	0.169	0.064	0.943	0.177	Normal
DIFFERENCE	Experimen	0.228	0.062	0.851	0.062	Normal
	Control	0.158	0.107	0.941	0.157	Normal

Based on the normality test results above, it is known that the significance value of the experimental class pretest data on the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test is 0.200 and the Shapiro-Kwilk test is 0.395> 0.05, so it is normally distributed. The control class data in the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test is 0.176 and the Shapiro-Kwilk test is 0.167> 0.05, so it is normally distributed. The post-test data for the experimental class in the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test is 0.200 and the Shapiro-Kwilk test is 0.446 > 0.05, so it is normally distributed. The control class post-test data on the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test was 0.064 and the Shapiro-Kwilk test was 0.177 > 0.05, so it was normally distributed. Furthermore, the data for the increase (difference) in the experimental class in the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test was 0.062 and in the Shapiro-Kwilk test it was 0.062 > 0.05. It was normally distributed. The data for the increase (different) in the control class in the Kolmogrov-Smirnov test is 0.107 and in the Shapiro-Kwilk test is 0.157> 0.05, so it is normally distributed. The homogeneity test was used to determine whether the data obtained from the two groups had homogeneous variants. The results of the homogeneity test are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Homogeneity Test Results

	Levene Statistic	Sig.	Conclusion
Pre	0.438	0.511	Homogen
Post	0.089	0.767	Homogen
Difference	0.838	0.364	Homogen

The homogeneity test results show that the Lavene-statistical probability value > Level of significant = 0.05, then the data meets the assumption of homogeneity. Thus, the population being studied has something in common or with each other. After the homogeneity test was carried out, it was continued to the paired sample t-test. The results of the paired sample t-test test are presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Paired Sample T-Test

Group	T berpasangan		Method conclusion
	Statistic	Sig.	
Experiment	11.330	0.000	Effective
Control	0.088	0.000	Effective

The paired sample t test above shows that the experimental class obtained a sig value of 0.000 <0.05, while the control group obtained a sig value of 0.000 <0.05. Thus, it can be concluded that the experimental class Project citizen learning model and the conventional control class learning model are both effective. The independent-sample t-test was used to determine whether there was a difference in the mean of two unpaired samples. Independent sample t test to answer the formulation of the problem whether there is a difference between the use of the Project citizen learning model and the conventional learning model. In this case, it can be seen in the difference in the post-test results of the experimental class and the control class. Independent sample t-test test data are presented in Table 5.

Table 5. The Results of the Independent Sample T-Test

	Lavene Test		Independent t-test						
	F	Sig.	t	df	Sig.	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
								Lower	Lower
Difference	0.838	0.363	2.078	48	0.043	7.44000	3.58017	0.24159	14.63841

Based on the results of the independent sample t-test in the table above, it is known that the sig value is 0.043 <0.05. It means that there are differences in using the Project citizen learning model with conventional learning models.

Discussion

The research analysis results show that the application of the project citizen learning model with the stages of identifying problems, choosing problems as class study material, collecting information, developing class portfolios, presenting portfolios, and reflecting on learning experiences can improve students' critical thinking. The project citizen learning model provides opportunities for students to learn according to their own pace and way. Project citizen is a learning technique to inspire students in the class, which can then be used as a model of citizen behavior in everyday life (Azmi, 2020; Sutrisno, 2019). In this model, students are taught how to get problem-based knowledge by analyzing the problems around them and how to solve the problems (Oktaviarini & Jadmiko, 2018; Rubei, 2020). With the implementation of the project citizen model in Citizenship Education, students are expected to have critical thinking skills on the concept of the rule of law. It is because learning the project citizen model focuses more on strategies for understanding students with the basics of knowledge, how citizens should take citizenship responsibilities (Mulyoto & Samsuri, 2017).

The strength of using the project citizen learning model is the transfer of knowledge skills and attitudes achieved through problem-based active learning strategies to develop knowledge, skills, and democratic citizenship traits that enable and encourage student participation in government and civil society (Astuti & Sahono, 2019; Hakim & Pradityayudha, 2021; Widodo et al., 2018). The project citizen program encourages to be actively involved with government organizations and civil society to solve a problem in the school or community as well as hone a problem in the school or community as well as hone social and intellectual intelligence, which is important for responsible democratic citizenship (Luqman, 2017; Mulyoto & Samsuri, 2017; Nusarastriya et al., 2017).

The project citizen program encourages to be actively involved with government organizations and civil society to solve a problem in the school or community, hone a problem in the school or community, and hone social and intellectual intelligence, which is important for responsible democratic citizenship. The project citizen program encourages to be actively involved with government organizations and civil society to solve a problem in the school or community as well as hone a problem in the school or community as well

as hone social and intellectual intelligence, which is important for responsible democratic citizenship (Fajri et al., 2021). The results of subsequent studies also reveal the same thing. It is stated that through project citizenship, students' critical thinking skills can be significantly improved through learning outcomes issued after learning (Saylendra, 2017). Other research also reveals that the basic values of anti-corruption education will be understood directly by students when through the learning process with the project citizen model, while the values that students will achieve consist of the values of honesty, caring, independence, discipline, responsibility, hard work, modesty, courage, and justice (Azmi, 2020). Based on the results of the research, which is supported by previous studies, it can be said that the application of the project citizen learning model can significantly develop students' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor abilities.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the research results above, this study concludes that there are differences in using the Project citizen learning model with conventional learning models. It means that the implementation of the project citizen model in civic education influences students' critical thinking skills on the concept of the rule of law.

5. REFERENCES

Aini, N. R., Syafril, S., Netriwati, N., Pahrudin, A., Rahayu, T., & Puspasari, V. (2019). Problem-Based Learning for Critical Thinking Skills in Mathematics. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1155*(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1155/1/012026.

Al-Khansa, B. B., & Dewi, D. A. (2021). Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan: Membangun Masyarakat Demokrasi Yang Berkeadaban Dari Saat Ini. *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, *5*(1), 249–258. https://doi.org/10.31316/jk.v5i1.1429.

Astuti, H., & Sahono, B. (2019). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen Untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Dan Prestasi Belajar. *Jurnal Ilmiah Teknologi Pendidikan*, *12*(1), 138–149. https://doi.org/10.33369/diadik.v12i1.21371.

Azmi, S. R. M. (2020). Implementasi Pendidikan Antikorupsi Pada Mata Kuliah Pkn Berbasis Project Citizen Di STMIK Royal Kisaran. *International Journal of Hypertension*, *1*(1), 1–171. https://doi.org/10.54314/jssr.v3i1.392.

Darwati, I. M., & Purana, I. M. (2021). Problem Based Learning (PBL) : Suatu Model Pembelajaran Untuk Mengembangkan Cara Berpikir Kritis Peserta Didik. *Widya Accarya*, *12*(1), 61–69. https://doi.org/10.46650/wa.12.1.1056.61-69.

Fajri, I., Yusuf, R., Zailani, M., & Yusoff, M. (2021). Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen Sebagai Inovasi Pembelajaran Dalam Meningkatkan Pemberdayaan manusia. *Jurnal Hurriah: Jurnal Evaluasi Pendidikan Dan Penelitian*, *2*(3), 105–118. https://academicareview.com/index.php/jh/article/view/30.

Hakim, T. L., & Pradityayudha, R. (2021). Implementasi Pendidikan Antikorupsi Pada Mata Pelajaran Ppkn Berbasis Project Citizen Di SMAN 6 Kabupaten Tangerang Banten. *Civics Education And Social Science Journal (CESSJ)*, *3*(2), 112. https://doi.org/10.32585/cessj.v3i2.1638.

Indayani, R., Supeno, I., & Wicaksono. (2021). Pengaruh Videoscribe Terhadap Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis Peserta Didik Pada Pembelajaran IPA. *Jurnal Pendidikan Sains Dan Matematika*, *2*(37), 107–115. https://doi.org/10.23971/eds.v9i2.2008.

Iriansyah, H. S. (2020). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen untuk Meningkatkan Critical Thinking Mahasiswa. *DWIJA CENDEKIA: Jurnal Riset Pedagogik*, *4*(1), 62. https://doi.org/10.20961/jdc.v4i1.40905.

Luqman, L. (2017). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Berpikir Kritis dan Kreatif Siswa. *Ilmu Pendidikan: Jurnal Kajian Teori Dan Praktik Kependidikan*, *2*(1), 44–59. https://doi.org/10.17977/um027v2i12017p044.

Mariyani. (2018). Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen Pada Mata Pelajaran PKn Sebagai Penguatan Ecological Citizenship. *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*, *8*(1), 99–08. https://doi.org/ /kewarganegaraan.v8i1.4279.

Mulyoto, G. P., & Samsuri, S. (2017). Pengaruh model project citizen dengan pendekatan saintifik terhadap penguasaan kompetensi kewarganegaraan dalam pembelajaran Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan. *Jurnal Civics: Media Kajian Kewarganegaraan*, *14*(1), 105–118. https://doi.org/10.21831/civics.v14i1.14566.

Nusarastriya, Y. H., Sapriya, Wahab, A. A., & Budimansyah, H. D. (2017). Pengembangan Berpikir Kritis

Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Menggunakan Project Citizen. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, *3*(3). https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v3i3.1631.

Oktaviarini, N., & Jadmiko, R. S. (2018). Peningkatan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Ips Dalam Penerapan Character Project Citizen (CPC) Berbasis Outdoor Study (Studi Pada Siswa Kelas IV SDN Kamulan 02 Kecamatan Talun Kabupaten Blitar). *Jurnal Inventa*, *2*(2), 26–36. https://doi.org/10.36456/inventa.2.2.a1646.

Pane, A., & Dasopang, M. D. (2017). Belajar Dan Pembelajaran. *Fitrah:Jurnal Kajian Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, *3*(2), 333. https://doi.org/10.24952/fitrah.v3i2.945.

Ramdani, A., Jufri, A. W., Jamaluddin, J., & Setiadi, D. (2020). Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis dan Penguasaan Konsep Dasar IPA Peserta Didik. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, *6*(1), 119–124. https://doi.org/10.29303/jppipa.v6i1.388.

Ritonga, M. K., Hasibuan, M. N. S., Rohana, & Siregar, M. (2020). Analisis Terhadap Mahasiswa Prodi PPKN STKIP Labuhanbatu Dalam Studi Kasus Kunjungan Perpustakaan Dan Aplikasinya Pada Penerapan Karakter Semangat Kebangsaan Tahun 2019. *Jurnal Educatin and Development*, *8*(3). https://doi.org/10.37081/ed.v8i3.1799.

Rubei, M. A. (2020). Penerapan model Project Citizen untuk peningkatkan pengetahuan dan sikap anti korupsi mahasiswa. *Jurnal Civic Education: Media Kajian Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, *4*(1). https://doi.org/10.36412/ce.v4i1.1876.

Sahari, S., & Wahyudi. (2020). Pengembangan Media Tata Surya Berbasis Macromedia Flash Sebagai Inovasi Pembelajaran Daring Untuk Siswa SD. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Nusantara*, *6*(1), 174–183. https://doi.org/10.29407/jpdn.v6i1.14711.

Saylendra, N. P. (2017). Peningkatan Berpikir Kritis Mahasiswa Melalui Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen. *Civics: Jurnal Pendidikan Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, *2*(1). https://doi.org/10.36805/civics.v2i1.288.

Setyowati, Y. (2019). Komunikasi Pemberdayaan sebagai Perspektif Baru Pengembangan Pendidikan Komunikasi Pembangunan di Indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi Pembangunan*, *17*(2), 188–199. https://doi.org/10.46937/17201926849.

Sujana, I. W. C. (2019). Fungsi Dan Tujuan Pendidikan Indonesia. *Adi Widya: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar*, *4*(1), 29. https://doi.org/10.25078/aw.v4i1.927.

Sulaiman, U., Ardianti, N., & Selviana, S. (2019). Tingkat Pencapaian Pada Aspek Perkembangan Anak Usia Dini 5-6 Tahun Berdasarkan Strandar Nasional Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini. *Nanaeke: Indonesian Journal of Early Childhood Education*, *2*(1), 52. https://doi.org/10.24252/nananeke.v2i1.9385.

Sutrisno. (2019). Penerapan Materi Pendidikan Global pada Mata Pelajaran PPKN di Sekolah Menengah Atas Berbasis Model Project Citizens. *Jurnal Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, *4*(1), 12–21. https://doi.org/10.24269/jpk.v4.n1.2019.pp12-21.

Thadi, R. (2019). Proses Komunikasi Instruksional dalam Pembelajaran Vokasional. *Journal of Education and Instruction (JOEAI)*, *2*(1), 49–55. https://doi.org/10.31539/joeai.v2i1.614.

Ulfa, I. S. K., Trapsilasiwi, D., & Yudianto, E. (2018). Profil Berpikir Kritis Siswa dalam Menyelesaikan Soal Fungsi Komposisi melalui Model Pembelajaran Kolaboratif. *Jurnal Didaktik Matematika*, *5*(1), 40–53. https://doi.org/10.24815/jdm.v5i1.9972.

Widodo, S. T., Renggani, R., & Sukarjo, S. (2018). Pengembangan Model Pembelajaran Project Citizen Berorientasi Civic Knowledge, Civic Disposition, Dan Civic Skill Sebagai Inovasi Dalam Mata Kuliah Pendidikan PKn SD. *PKn Progresif: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Penelitian Kewarganegaraan*, *13*(1), 23. https://doi.org/10.20961/pknp.v13i1.23262.

Yanizon, A., & Adiningtyas, S. W. (2018). Modul Layanan Bimbingan Kelompok Dalam Meningkatkan Diskusi Aktif Dan Berpikir Kritis Mahasiswa Program Studi Bimbingan Konseling Universitas Riau Kepulauan. *Kopasta: Jurnal Program Studi Bimbingan Konseling*, *5*(2). https://doi.org/10.33373/kop.v5i2.1523.

Yuliah, E. (2020). Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan. *Jurnal At-Tadbir : Media Hukum Dan Pendidikan*, *30*(2), 129–153. https://doi.org/10.52030/attadbir.v30i2.58.